

170

NY(C) Report of Survey of
The Board of Education
and
The Board of Higher Education

ADMINISTRATIVE
MANAGEMENT
OF THE
SCHOOL SYSTEM
OF
NEW YORK CITY

A View in Perspective
and a
Summary of Recommendations

Mayor's Committee
on Management Survey

EDUCATION
MANAGEMENT STUDY

George D. Strayer
Louis E. Yavner
Directors

October 1951



MAYOR'S COMMITTEE ON MANAGEMENT SURVEY
OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK
131 LIVINGSTON STREET
BROOKLYN 2, N. Y.
MAIN 4-5613

COMMITTEE

EDUCATION MANAGEMENT STUDY

GEORGE D. STRAYER
LOUIS E. YAVNER
Directors

LAZARUS JOSEPH
Chairman

SAUL LEVY
Vice Chairman

BENJAMIN FIELDING
Secretary

ABRAHAM D. BEAME
MISS CHARLOTTE CARR
SAMUEL DAVIS
ROBERT W. DOWLING
HENRY EPSTEIN
LAWRENCE GEROSA
BERNARD F. GIMBEL
PETER GRIMM
GEORGE H. HALLETT, JR.
MORRIS IUSHEWITZ
JOHN S. LINEN
GEORGE F. MAND
THOMAS JEFFERSON MILEY
MRS. RALPH B. MORRIS
ROBERT MOSES
NATHAN M. OHRBACH
THOMAS J. PATTERSON
DELMONT PFEFFER
GENEROSO POPE JR.
CHARLES F. PREUSSE
JAMES C. QUINN
WILLIAM REID
VICTOR S. RIESENFELD
DR. CHANNING TOBIAS
THOMAS TOZZI

October 15, 1951

Honorable Lazarus Joseph
Comptroller of the City of New York
Municipal Building
New York 7, N. Y.

Dear Mr. Comptroller:

We submit herewith our Final Report on the Administrative Management of the School System of the City of New York. It marks the conclusion of an intensive 13-month study by a staff of some 20 analysts under our direction.

In April 1951 we submitted to the Mayor's Committee on Management Survey an Interim Report which dealt with some aspects of the Division of Housing of the Board of Education, and with related administrative problems. Following immediate endorsement by the Board of Education of our major recommendation for top reorganization of the administrative structure, also endorsed by the Mayor's Committee, Superintendent of Schools William Jansen wrote to the Board of Education on May 22, 1951: "Since I find the report essentially constructive and agree with its major findings, I believe that there should not be any delay in acting upon the recommendations that give immediate promise of administrative improvement."

This spirit of mutual cooperation has marked the entire study, and we are deeply grateful to Dr. Jansen for his unstinting help and advice, and for the many hours, day and evening, which he devoted to conferring with us about all parts of the study.

At the outset of the study the Board of Education designated Charles Gilman, its Auditor, to act as its liaison officer. Mr. Gilman, on whom governors, mayors, and city, state, and educational officers have relied for many years

to provide accurate and dependable information about school business and fiscal affairs, proved to be no less an authority for us. We leaned heavily on his wealth of experience and his great ability as a business executive. We cannot let this occasion pass without expressing our sincere appreciation.

So many scores of Board officials and employees were helpful that we can only thank them all, without a special listing. Yet, we imposed so often upon two gifted men, Jules Haut, Construction Consultant to the Board, and Basil T. Coleman, Statistician of the Division of Housing, that we must state our indebtedness to them.

All of the members of the Board of Education were most generous in their assistance. While we conferred more often, because of their special background, with Maximillian Moss, President of the Board, Charles Bensley, Chairman of the Committee on Buildings and Sites, and James Marshall, the senior member of the Board, we received helpful cooperation and advice from all members.

Officials of the Board of Higher Education were equally cooperative. To Dr. Ordway Tead, Chairman of the Board, Henry E. Schultz, Chairman of the Executive Committee, and Mrs. Pearl Max, Administrator of the Board, we owe much.

A study of this magnitude presents its own policy and administrative problems. Often these could not have been solved except for the unflagging support of the Sub-Committee on Education, consisting of Mrs. Ralph B. Morris, its chairman, Miss Charlotte Carr, Samuel Davis, and Dr. Channing Tobias.

Nor could these problems have been met without the wise counsel and constant help of Dr. Luther Gulick, Executive Director of the Mayor's Committee on Management Survey. We are also indebted for a great deal of assistance to Dr. Gulick's executive assistant, Carl Heyel.

Of the efforts of our own staff we are especially appreciative. This Final Report reflects their competence, imagination, and diligence. Particularly it reflects the leadership and creative ability of Maurice G. Postley, assistant director of the study, Herbert O. Patchel, chief engineer, Lester J. Rosner, executive assistant, Clarence Weiner, economist and statistician, and Elwood L. Prestwood, chief research associate. We call special attention also to the important contributions of two of our consultants, the architectural firm of Reisner and Urbahn, which prepared the chapter on "Architectural Considerations," and Dr. David G. Salten, Superintendent of Schools of Long Beach, New York, who directed the study of the Board of Examiners.

Sincerely yours,

George D. Strayer and Louis E. Yavner
Directors of the Study

Members of the
Board of Education

1950-1951

- -
-

Maximilian Moss, President

Charles J. Bensley

James Marshall

Andrew G. Clauson, Jr.

Dr. Charles F. Rank

Rev. John M. Coleman

George A. Timone

Vito F. Lanza

Cornelius J. Walsh

MAYOR'S COMMITTEE ON MANAGEMENT SURVEY

Mayor Vincent Impellitteri
Lazarus Joseph, Chairman
Saul Levy, Vice Chairman
Benjamin Fielding, Secretary

Abraham D. Beame	Thomas Jefferson Miley
Miss Charlotte Carr	Mrs. Ralph B. Morris
Samuel Davis	Robert Moses
Robert W. Dowling	Nathan M. Ohrbach
Henry Epstein	Thomas J. Patterson
Lawrence Gerosa	Delmont Pfeffer
Bernard F. Gimbel	Generoso Pope, Jr.
Peter Grimm	Charles F. Preusse
George H. Hallett, Jr.	James C. Quinn
Charles Horowitz	William Reid
Morris Iushewitz	Victor S. Riesenfeld
John S. Linen	Dr. Channing Tobias
George F. Mand	Thomas Tozzi
John P. McGrath	

Dr. Luther Gulick, Executive Director
Carl Heyel, Executive Assistant

Subcommittee for Education*

Mrs. Ralph B. Morris, Chairman
Mrs. Charlotte Carr
Samuel Davis
Dr. Channing Tobias

* And the officers of the Committee, ex officio

STAFF OF THE EDUCATION MANAGEMENT STUDY

Directors

Louis E. Yavner

George D. Strayer

* * *

Assistant Director
Maurice G. Postley

Chief Engineer
Herbert O. Patchel

Executive Assistant
Lester J. Rosner

Chief Research Associate
Elwood Prestwood

Economist
Clarence M. Weiner

Consultants

Reisner and Urbahn

David G. Salten

Staff Members

Eileen Ahern
Edward M. Applebaum
Lee Ariel
Jerome Barry
Meyer D. Bashein
David Bernstein
William H. Bisnoff
Gerald R. Coleman
Francis Cowan, Jr.
Evelyn Fassberg

Harold H. Goldberg
Noble C. Hiebert
Burton S. Klapper
Morris J. Lieberman
Samuel London
Pauline H. Rogers
Gertrude Ruskin
Samuel Vigan
Lester E. Vogel
Raymond W. Young

T A B L E O F C O N T E N T S

VOLUME ONE

<u>CHAPTER</u>		<u>PAGE</u>
I	THE ADMINISTRATION OF SCHOOLS IN NEW YORK CITY	1
II	THE ADMINISTRATIVE STAFF	13
III	THE ASSISTANT SUPERINTENDENT	78
IV	THE PRINCIPAL AND THE FIELD SUPERINTENDENT	108
V	✓ THE ORGANIZATION OF SCHOOLS	119
VI	✓ ORGANIZATION OF CLASSES	130
VII	CUSTODIAL SERVICE	159
VIII	SCHOOL UTILIZATION	251
IX	SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION	310
X	ARCHITECTURAL CONSIDERATIONS	363
XI	✓ THE SUPPLY OPERATION -- A MANAGEMENT CHALLENGE	380
XII	THE SCHOOL BUS TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM	527
XIII	PAYROLL MECHANIZATION	566
XIV	RECORDS MANAGEMENT	588

VOLUME TWO

XV	SCHOOL LUNCH PROGRAMS	625
XVI	EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH AND STATISTICS	667
XVII	STATISTICAL AND TABULATING OPERATIONS	678
XVIII	TEACHERS ASSIGNED TO HEADQUARTERS	708
XIX	THE BOARD OF EXAMINERS	749
XX	PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION	823
XXI	OFFICE SERVICES	878
XXII	OFFICE OF BUSINESS AFFAIRS	897
XXIII	FISCAL RELATIONSHIPS OF THE BOARD OF EDUCATION WITH THE MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT	906
XXIV	FISCAL AND POLITICAL RESPONSIBILITY	960
XXV	LOCAL SCHOOL BOARDS	986
XXVI	THE ROAD AHEAD: A DECENTRALIZED SCHOOL SYSTEM	993
XXVII	THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE MUNICIPAL COLLEGES	1001
XXVIII	THE NEED FOR TECHNICAL INSTITUTES AND COMMUNITY COLLEGES	1052
XXIX	THE FISCAL RELATIONSHIPS OF THE BOARD OF HIGHER EDUCATION	1084
XXX	FISCAL CONTROL BY THE BUDGET DIRECTOR AND THE COMPTROLLER	1129
XXXI	FOR INCORPORATION IN THE STATE UNIVERSITY	1176

A VIEW IN PERSPECTIVE

The First Objective

From more than a thousand pages of this Final Report, from many thousands of pages of work papers, from hundreds of conferences, this prefatory digest presents the essence of a year of observation, study and analysis of the largest public school system of any city in the world.

The first objective of the Education Management Study was to determine whether the activities now conducted by the Board of Education and the Board of Higher Education are so organized and administered as to fulfill their potential in providing an educationally satisfactory program.

From the beginning, the Mayor's Committee on Management Survey properly recognized that the administrative process cannot be separated from the objectives and programs to be served. Hence the Committee adopted the objective set forth in the preceding paragraph, as part of the scope of this study.

The categorical answer to the first question is that the activities of the two Boards are not so "organized and administered so as to fulfill their potential in providing an educationally satisfactory program."

This fundamental finding, if stated in such direct terms, is subject to dangerous misinterpretation, for it implies a vast failure that is simply not the fact.

Viewing the milieu in which the two educational boards have functioned and placing their activities in perspective, there is much to be found that is encouraging, stimulating and promising.

That, compressed for the moment into capsule form, brings us to the next objective of this study.

The Second Objective

The statement of scope adopted by the Committee says:

"The second objective is to determine whether it is possible to make administrative improvements in the school system that will result in more value for the public's money; whether needs for increased service can be met at least in part by feasible economies in existing services."

The categorical answer to that question is that administrative improvements can be made that will result in more value for the public's money. Further, this report finds that needs for more service can be met in part, at least, from feasible economies in existing services.

That simple statement of findings, like the first one, is also subject to misconstruction for it would be an injustice to many competent, hard-working, self-sacrificing persons to permit an inference to be drawn of a degree of callous disregard for the public interest. It would also be an injustice to infer that there is anything but a high degree of integrity at all levels of the school system; the very few cases of dishonest activity that arise are so small in relation to the size of the staff that it must be recognized that the Board of Education has a very praiseworthy record.

Some Improvements Can Begin Today

Certainly the most casual observer will agree that a great responsibility is imposed upon the Survey staff in presenting this report to make every reasonable effort to maintain a clear perspective of the vast panorama that

is New York's educational system.

Toward this end, the attention of the reader is directed to the large number of findings in many areas of activities. The Interim Report and this Final Report propose changes in administration that should lead to operating savings or added values of over \$3,500,000 a year. The Final Report also shows how savings in future Capital Budgets can be made, savings that total \$4,667,000, in addition to similar savings proposed in the Interim Report.

Some of these changes are necessarily linked to each other, but many are not. It is not necessary to make all the changes simultaneously. It may not even be practicable. Many of them are not at all related to each other. They can be attacked, in different places in the school system, one at a time, but not necessarily all at one time.

That there will be disagreement as to technique in one respect or another is inevitable, but that is not a reason for failing to correct administrative error or waste where it is clearly discernible to the impartial eye. Indeed, there are areas where the techniques of analysis revealed in both the Interim Report and the Final Report can now be extended by the present school staff. The pursuit of these threads of administration may save even greater sums than have been indicated.

Differing Views About What Is Significant

But there is a great deal more to the story than that. The Final Report, touching so many facets of educational problems in New York, may well provoke in the minds of different persons a wide variety of different centers of interest. Running the gamut of scores of proposals, there will be those individuals who will find the method of selecting Board members

most important; those who will select as most vital the problem of financing the schools; those who will accent the urgency of reorganized top management; those who will be alarmed at evidences of waste through poor planning and organization, and so on.

To serve a useful and constructive purpose, this report seeks to show the relationship of the many factors to each other, but seeks also to show how they are severable, how they may be approached separately and how improvements may be achieved along many different avenues so long as there is tolerance and the will to achieve improvement.

The Emphases of the Report

Since the emphasis of a management report is necessarily upon existing conditions that can be improved, it is the imperfect condition that is singled out for identification and analysis. The normal--indeed the superb--is taken for granted. It would therefore be unfortunate if such a study as this, in its insistence upon what may be done more efficiently, should seem to ignore what is well done. The Education Management Study could hardly report in detail upon the constructive aspects of New York City's educational system and at the same time perform its duty in the light of the two objectives cited above, and other responsibilities.

It is nonetheless regrettable that specific mention cannot be made of individuals and their work, for New York City could not carry on its extensive and important educational program were it not for the devotion and intelligent application of thousands of men and women, many of whom serve far beyond the call of duty with neither hope nor wish of personal recognition.

The criticisms directed at the school system by this report indicate the need for far-reaching and basic improvements. This, however, should not obscure or deny the simple fact that there are many schools throughout the system in each of which a broad-visioned principal has established excellent staff, pupil, parent and community relationships; where a generally alert and professionally-minded teaching staff is implementing a judiciously selected program of democratic and effective learning; where the school routines and business arrangements are wisely planned and efficiently administered; and where, in short, an institution of learning, soundly based on modern and progressive philosophy of education is carrying out the task which the community has a right to expect of it. Nor should it obscure or deny the fact that the headquarters organization has many individuals and units whose work is outstandingly efficient, constructive, and far-sighted.

Drastic, Affirmative Action is Necessary

Turning from the examples of superior individual or group performance, and viewing the enterprise broadly, it is clear that drastic, affirmative action is necessary to eradicate many grave faults in the school system.

These faults are costly in terms of dollars, but they have an additional significance of the first order. They obstruct the school system from achieving its objective, which is the best possible education for the individual child consistent with the amount of money available.

To waste an educational dollar is unpardonable as a matter of financial prudence, but it is all the more serious when it is clear that the money can be used more effectively as an instrument of education.

Pressures Prevent Planning

The single greatest weakness of the school system is that it is an administrative patchwork quilt. It grew in response to immediate demands or impulses. But its growth was not planned.

New York City has expanded prodigiously through the years. The school system has striven to keep pace with the giant.

Divisions, boards, committees, bureaus and offices were created and fastened onto the organization at the point where the immediate crisis seemed to require.

Under normal circumstances, so colossal an undertaking would chart its course in terms of known and reasonably predictable future demands. It would, in short, plan its growth. Each successive organizational move would be viewed as part of a whole. Whether this was practicable, though desirable, is quite beside the point today. The existing conditions have grown up under the stress of daily burdens over a long period of years and a retrospective journey to find fault with individuals serves no constructive purpose.

After careful effort in cooperation with members of the Board of Education, the Superintendent of Schools, and other top executives, the Interim Report presented a plan of reorganization to meet the school systems needs. With this record before it, it may be hoped that the Board of Education will not now be pressured into a different series of organizational changes that will create more problems than they will solve.

Two Examples of Poor Planning

The effects of rapid growth, which has sometimes caused improvisation instead of basic planning, may be encountered in many places in the school

system. For instance, at the very center of the Board of Education, two unrelated courses have been followed in organizing the headquarters staff and assigning administrative personnel. One is based upon school levels - elementary, junior high school and senior high school, the other upon administrative functions that relate to all these levels. This lack of a basic, over-all plan may be observed also farther out from the center of the system in the organization of the various divisions and bureaus, where subdivisions have been established without clear-cut standards for a guide. Sometimes the connection seems almost haphazard, as when community education was first placed in the Division of Housing, then in the Division of Child Welfare, later in the Elementary Schools Division and more recently in the Junior High Schools Division.

Sometimes growth without basic planning has produced differing systems that exist side by side, causing a confusion of methods and an inequality of results. An example is the custodial service. The original direct civil service system was abandoned and supplanted by an indirect, quasi-contractual system, under which it was found that some custodians in full charge of the operation of small school buildings received less net income than cleaners in large schools, whereas custodian-engineers in large schools were the beneficiaries of a much larger net compensation than the Superintendent of the Bureau of Plant Operation and Maintenance, several echelons higher in rank. The modified indirect system was devised in an attempt to patch up the situation, but after it had been installed in about half the schools there was ample evidence that it was no panacea for inequities, and it was extended to no more schools. Now the two systems coexist, with the essential inequities

still uncorrected. More important, extreme variations are found in the quality of custodial service rendered, so that while some schools are immaculate, others are dirty and ill-kept.

So it goes throughout the system. Improvisation can be seen in many quarters, where fundamental planning is requisite.

The remedy is obvious. A basic appraisal of aims and methods is needed in every part of the school system.

The People and Their Schools

The first objective established by the Mayor's committee, to which reference was made at the outset, penetrates to the core of the over-all problem of education in New York City. The "potential in providing a satisfactory educational program" involves a consideration of fundamentals.

One of these fundamentals is the relationship between the people and their schools.

Though it is axiomatic, the fact bears repetition that the whole concept of public education in the United States assumes that the public schools belong to the people. And this implies a closeness between the people and their schools. To realize their "potential in providing a satisfactory educational program," the schools must be near the people in conformance with that American tradition.

The tragic fact in New York City is that notwithstanding the best of effort and intention by everyone the people of the city are not nearly as close to their schools as people are in other communities throughout the United States. This may be a problem equally as difficult to solve in other large cities, but that is not a reason for abandoning all hope in New York City.

Even the slightest glance at the relationship of the community to the schools elsewhere throughout the United States will convince any impartial observer that public participation in school affairs is the best insurance of well-administered schools. A glimpse, for example, at the extraordinary school experience of the people of Arlington County, Virginia, will reveal how public participation stimulates and gives life to the public schools. Arlington County, with a background of aloof administration for perhaps a hundred years, learned what public participation can mean in the improvement of the schools. This now famous experience has been repeated in varying degrees during the past few years all over the country. The beginnings of similar experimentation in New York City is reported in this Final Report.

Public Participation Means Better Education

The record is clear that public participation means better education for children--and, at the same time, more efficient and therefore more economical administration. The public is quick to sense waste in the schools because the public is concerned with getting maximum education for the educational dollar.

In examining the potentials, therefore, of the educational system in New York, the Education Management Study came to grips with the problem that exists today, the separation of the people from their schools. A way to appraise this problem would have been to identify it and suggest that public interest may be awakened. But such a course would leave the city precisely where it is today. It is for this reason that the Survey staff has considered a change in the essential pattern of relationships so that a new era may dawn in New York City for the people and their schools.

1 $\frac{1}{4}$
P. 11
P. 16

SUMMARY OF MAJOR RECOMMENDATIONS

CHAPTER I. The Administration of Schools in New York City

1. Relieve the members of the Board of Education from consideration of a multitude of administrative matters which properly should be the concern of the professional staff. This would permit the Board to give more adequate consideration to major policy questions.
2. Differentiate clearly the responsibilities of the lay Board of Education and the professional staff of the schools. Members of the Board commonly assume administrative responsibilities, thus undermining the basic functional relationships which should exist in the operation of the school system. The Board should retain full responsibility for determining policies which in its judgment will produce an adequate system of public education. But responsibility for implementing and administering policies should be vested clearly in the professional staff.
3. End the current practice of certain Board members acting as individuals on school problems. They have a responsibility for acting as members of a Board.

CHAPTER II. The Administrative Staff

4. Vest full control and responsibility for the school system's supervisory and administrative staff in the Superintendent of Schools. As chief executive officer of the school system, he would be responsible and accountable for all staff work.
5. Reorganize the top administrative structure to provide urgently

needed assistance to the Superintendent of Schools in executing his functions and responsibilities. Three new major positions should be established: a Deputy Superintendent of Schools, an Administrator of Housing, and an Administrator of Business Affairs.

6. Assign to the Deputy Superintendent of Schools the authority and responsibility for coordinating the work of the eight associate superintendents, each to be given a specific functional responsibility in the proposed headquarters reorganization.
7. Assign to the Administrator of Housing all major functions relating to the building, modernization, operation and maintenance of school buildings. This Administrator should head an office with four major divisions: Programming; Construction and Contract Repairs; Plant Operation and Maintenance; and Administration. The Programming Division would have responsibility for effective plant utilization, determining school building needs, establishing priorities of need and for site selection. The Construction and Contract Repairs Division would plan for and construct new buildings, develop and execute modernization programs and contract for major additions and repairs to existing school buildings. The Plant Operation and Maintenance Division would have responsibility for custodial services, the operation of repair shops, and general maintenance and repair services for school buildings. The Administration Division would be responsible for providing the facilitative services to the other divisions, maintaining personnel and cost data, budget estimating and general administrative work.
8. Assign to the Administrator of Business Affairs these major responsi-

bilities: budget estimating and preparation; all accounting and auditing services; purchase, storage and distribution of school textbooks, supplies and equipment; school transportation service; operation of the school lunch programs; budgetary and management analysis and review; and fiscal controls.

9. Create eight functional divisions in the headquarters organization each to be headed by an associate superintendent reporting to the Deputy Superintendent of Schools. These divisions are: Instruction, Curriculum, Organization, Research, Personnel, Child Welfare, Special Services, and Public Information.

10. Make the Division of Instruction responsible for the educational programs now offered by four separate divisions: elementary schools, junior high schools, vocational high schools and academic high schools. The education of children and youth is a continuing process from kindergarten through the high school. The program of education provided in the New York City Schools should be integrated, not cut up into separate units. There are different emphases at different age levels, but they should be considered in relation to the total education being provided.

11. Assign to the Division of Curriculum responsibility for the improvement of the instructional program relating to curriculum development. This Division should enlist and use effectively the ideas, talents and abilities of teachers and principals in the schools as well as those of the headquarters staff.

12. Make the Division of Organization responsible for important regulatory and management functions. This Division should be charged with the responsibility for child accounting and the preparation of reports re-

quired for establishing eligibility of the school system for state and federal appropriations. It should have responsibility for the organization of all schools and play a major role in determining class size.

13. Consolidate all the research activities carried on in the school system in one Division of Research. This Division should undertake research for any department of the school system that needs such assistance. In addition to its own independent research studies the Division should engage in cooperative projects with other school divisions.

14. Fix responsibility on all personnel matters in the Division of Personnel. The present dual personnel organization structure should be ended. One administrative department should be charged with authority and responsibility for personnel transactions covering all employees of the Board of Education - the civil service administrative staff as well as the teaching and professional supervisory staffs. The Associate Superintendent in charge of this Division should be the School Superintendent's representative in all relationships with the Board of Examiners.

15. Assign to the Division of Child Welfare responsibility for providing the clinical services that some pupils require and the special facilities that physically and mentally handicapped and emotionally disturbed children need. Clinical services should be provided by special service teams assigned to the offices of the field assistant superintendents.

16. Make the Division of Special Services responsible for a variety of special functions which will vary from time to time depending upon the needs of the schools. Among its regular assignments, it should

have responsibility for the health and attendance programs and for civil defense.

17. Charge the Division of Public Information with the important assignment of establishing a public information program as a two-way process - - a cooperative search for mutual understanding and effective teamwork between the people of the city and the school staffs. It should encourage a continuous, positive approach to public relations by all school personnel. It should work closely with the assistant superintendents in the field in the effort to use community resources effectively.

CHAPTER III. The Assistant Superintendent

18. Make the field superintendent the administrative officer in charge of all schools in his area, to include the vocational and academic high schools, as well as the elementary and junior high schools. This would permit the planning of a continuing and integrated program of education from the kindergarten through the high school.

19. Vest in the field superintendent full authority and supervision over the staff assigned to his office.

20. Clarify the basic functions of the field superintendent. He should have the responsibility for developing a program of education, authorized by the Board of Education, in such manner as to serve most effectively the needs of the children, youth, and adults in his area. He should play a major role in the organization and reorganization of schools. He should seek to develop new methods, new materials, and new procedures for the improvement of instruction. He should work toward better school-community relationships.

21. Restore some degree of local autonomy to the community in the operation of the schools. Headquarters offices should be concerned with determining school policies and providing basic services for the schools. Also they should retain controls relating to the execution of policy in the field. But the field superintendent should be given sufficient leeway to adapt programs and policies to express community needs.

22. Organize and staff the office of the field superintendent so that the superintendent will be relieved of time-consuming, routine matters which should properly be handled by staff assistants. He should be freed from the burden of petty administrative detail to permit him to act as an educational and community leader. The number and types of skilled supervisory aides may vary from district to district depending upon the local problems encountered and the special programs undertaken.

CHAPTER IV. The Principal and the Field Superintendent

#4 23. Vest in the field superintendents full authority over staff assigned and provide additional staff specialists to improve the supervisory services offered to the schools in their areas. In most cases, services offered to elementary schools are excellent. However, some inadequacies were found, chiefly traceable to lack of adequate staff in the field superintendents' offices and limitations on the power of superintendents to organize and direct their staffs.

24. Organize a system of teacher supervision in the junior high schools (similar to the first assistants in the senior high schools) for a more effective program of supervision. In the alternative, enlarge the field superintendent's staff of specialists so that the junior high schools

could be serviced as well as the elementary schools. The relationships that now exist between the junior high school principals and the field superintendents are, for the most part, superficial. Regulatory control of these schools in both curriculum and organization presently comes from headquarters offices.

#6 25. Establish clearly the major functions and responsibilities of the school principal. These are: execution of policies determined by the Board of Education; organization of his school to meet the needs of the community; provision of supervisory assistance for all teachers assigned; sponsorship of in-service training programs for teachers; study and participation in community life in order to know and understand the community; and provision of democratic leadership for his teaching staff.

h
to
26. Release and give scope to the creative talents of teachers by making them responsible participants in the development of educational programs. Too many teachers in the school system have been given little or no opportunity to participate constructively and creatively in the planning or evaluation of curriculums and teaching methods.

CHAPTER V. The Organization of Schools

organs
27. Lessen the degree of departmentalization of classes in the junior high schools. The tendency to pattern the junior high school after the senior high school has resulted in excessive departmentalization in the former. The transition of the student from the 6th grade elementary to the junior high school has been made almost as abrupt as between 8th-year elementary and the senior high school. Thus, the junior high school originally organized to bridge the gap between elementary and secondary

education has been departmentalized to a point where it creates a similar gap of its own.

28. Make a number of the senior high schools comprehensive in purpose and program so that all youth in the city may have access to varied curriculums regardless of the school in which registered. The proposed comprehensive high school would provide a program sufficiently flexible to care for the interests of all students: general exploratory courses for those undecided in interest or vocation; general courses with vocational emphasis for those who plan to terminate their formal education upon finishing high school; and enriched courses and accelerated programs for those with special talents and abilities. Some specialization, particularly in the vocational fields, is clearly advisable and training in highly specialized fields will continue to demand high schools with specialized programs.

CHAPTER VI. Organization of Classes

29. Continue the development of special educational facilities for atypical children. The New York City School system has made excellent progress towards meeting the special needs of the mentally retarded, the physically handicapped and the emotionally maladjusted children in the City. Special facilities have also been developed at all school levels for the intellectually gifted youngsters. The New York City program for atypical children ranks as one of the most effective in the nation. However, special classes for children with special educational needs are not always available at the most convenient times or places and further development of this phase of the school program is needed.

CHAPTER VII. Custodial Service

30. Design and install adequate quality controls to eliminate the current extreme variations in the quality of custodial service. This requires developing standards of performance, measuring performance against the standards, and providing incentives, positive and negative, to assure performance.
31. Develop standards to govern supervision over custodial service, with provision for an effective rating system.
32. Revise the system of allotting monies for custodial supplies to each school.
33. Compensate custodians in relation to their work load. The present compensation schedule is unjust, with certain custodians earning far more than they should and others earning much less than they should.
34. Improve the proposed new schedule of custodial compensation which has some advantages over the present schedules but leaves uncorrected some difficulties of the present schedules.
35. Require custodians to charge no more than scheduled fees for use of their schools by outside organizations after school hours.
36. Promote custodians, so long as the present quasi-contractual system is continued, on the basis of proven ability, dependability and other performance characteristics. The present promotion system ignores these qualifications.
37. Require custodial helpers provided by the custodians to furnish proof of good character and good health before they are permitted to have the freedom of the schools.

38. Require custodians, so long as they have the quasi-contractual status, to provide proper working conditions for their employees.
39. Abolish the present quasi-contractual system of custodial service. It has failed to work, and each variation attempted has failed to work.
40. Substitute for the quasi-contractual system either a true direct civil service system, or a true contractual system. The additional cost of a civil service system as compared with the present system would be about \$1,400,000 and not the \$3,600,000 estimated in 1946 by a Board of Education committee. A true contractual system might prove the least costly of all three: if adopted the change-over should be a gradual one.

CHAPTER VIII. School Utilization

41. Convert the 6-year Board of Education estimate of capital outlay projects, required by the City Charter, from one designed only to comply with the legal requirements into a long range program which should be a carefully conceived plan of action for each neighborhood of the City, a realistic step-by-step project for improving the plant of the school system. It should constitute an integrated program for each neighborhood and for the City as a whole, instead of containing, as it does now, mutually inconsistent proposals.
42. Develop a capital budget program through a school-by-school, neighborhood-by-neighborhood review of existing facilities in relation to need.
43. Develop a long range program whose objective will be to provide adequate school facilities in every neighborhood of the City at all educational levels.

44. Modernize existing facilities to bring them as close to existing standards as possible.
45. Close obsolete structures if they cannot be modernized, either by (a) merger of school districts with nearby schools which now have modern facilities or which could have them through modernization; or (b) replacement by new construction, preferably on sites so selected as to permit the replacement of two or more obsolete structures, either immediately or when the peak of the area's enrollments has passed.
46. Repair all buildings that are structurally sound and educationally adequate (i.e., with classrooms of sufficient size, well-lighted and ventilated, sufficient sanitary facilities, etc.), but which cannot now be used at normal capacity because of needed repairs.
47. Reallocate space use so that offices and administrative units do not occupy buildings or classrooms needed for instruction, and so that junior high schools, academic and vocational high schools, either in annexes or entire buildings, do not occupy space needed for elementary classes.
48. Review, and where necessary redistrict school boundaries at all educational levels throughout the city so that overcrowding and the use of older buildings is reduced and the more modern, suitable facilities are more fully utilized.
49. Eliminate traffic hazards, in so far as modern traffic control and engineering techniques permit, to equalize the use of existing facilities.
50. Reduce or eliminate social and racial tensions, through full mobilization of modern group work and community relations techniques, so

that available school facilities can be more fully utilized.

51. Engage in advance planning of school facilities adjacent to large-scale housing projects, and the long-term lease of classroom space in large-scale public and private housing developments, for kindergarten and the lower grades.

52. Convert suitable facilities to junior high school use where this will relieve overcrowding in K-8 elementary schools and the ninth grade of vocational and academic high schools, or conversely, convert in some neighborhoods, underutilized or unsuitable junior high school capacity to elementary school use.

53. Use more bus and subway transportation, particularly by upper grade pupils, so as to use classroom space that would otherwise remain empty.

54. Construct new facilities such as elementary, junior high, vocational or academic high school buildings, as a last measure, where the above alternatives are insufficient or impossible.

55. Establish as soon as possible, the Division of Programming in the proposed Office of Housing which was recommended in the Education Management Study's Interim Report published last April. Give it the function, which no individual or unit in the school system now has the facilities to execute, of developing and constantly reviewing the long range capital budget program. Properly organized, the Division of Programming should eliminate the present difficulties which stem from a combination of unimaginative leadership, inadequate administration and insufficient staff. Additional staff will cost money, but it will be an inconsequential sum compared to the dollar savings effected by eliminating the

cost of maintaining, repairing and operating obsolete buildings that could be abandoned -- to say nothing of the intangible cost in lost educational values borne by children needlessly attending substandard schools.

56. Establish within the Division of Programming two major units: a School Population Analysis Unit to be headed by a Chief Statistician, and a Schools Facilities Analysis Unit to be headed by a Chief Engineer.

57. Close P.S. 70 Manhattan, an example of an obsolete structure that can be closed, and save \$18,000 a year in maintenance operation and overhead. Not only is this school presently unnecessary, but the Board's request in its 1952-57 Capital Program for \$1,300,000 to replace P.S. 70 is unwarranted. Instead, what is needed for this neighborhood is a new junior high school.

58. Revise the Board of Education's East Harlem Capital Program as proposed in the Report to bring speedier relief from overcrowding. Close obsolete schools without replacement and improve the educational facilities of the area -- at 2/3rds the cost proposed by the Board of Education, or a saving of \$3,367,000 in the proposed expenditure.

CHAPTER IX. School Construction

59. Reorganize the Bureau of Construction to provide first that its head should be one competent as an administrator rather than necessarily as an architect, and second, so that clearly-defined organizational units deal with the separate basic functions of design and construction.

60. Establish a Research Bureau in the Division of Housing to be charged with the responsibility of examining new ideas in school design

in order to incorporate new educational methods and to make use of new materials or building methods.

61. Improve planning and design to avoid hazards, discomfort and need for repairs, as illustrated in the Final Report.
62. Improve inspection which has often been either insufficient or inept, to eliminate hazards and waste.
63. Revise systems and procedures to permit greater efficiency and to avoid waste of educational funds.
64. Police the guarantee periods so that these do not lapse before contractors are required to make repairs of faulty construction.
65. Correct the change-order practices and procedures, which are now extraordinarily confused. The Bureau of Construction performance in connection with change-orders is poor and extravagant, partly because the responsibility and authority are divided.
66. Provide for standard arbitration clauses in contract forms to enable adjustment of disputes without present expense and loss of time.
67. Revise the procedure for making test borings: because of legal restrictions, test borings are either frequently inadequate or are negotiated by contractual subterfuges that evade the existing law.
68. Employ permanent civil service employees instead of provisionals who often have less ability than the job requires and whose turnover rate is high because incentive to stay is lacking.
69. Improve working conditions, which are very poor. This may also help improve employee morale, which is very low.
70. Develop standard plans for such units as classrooms, shops, audi-

toriums, lunchrooms, gymnasiums, cafeterias and toilet rooms, instead of attempting to standardize plans for an entire school. When the standard unit plans are assembled with appropriate foundation plans they would constitute the plans for schools of varying sizes and shapes and would meet practically all functional, neighborhood and topographical requirements.

71. Experiment with farming out architectural work to private architects, but maintain careful controls so as to compare costs and the productivity of new ideas in school construction.

CHAPTER X. Architectural Considerations

72. Write instructions and rules for architects, stripped of pedagogical terminology but containing the objectives and philosophy of education, so that they are a source of information or even instruction, not a prop for the weak or a defense for the uninformed.

73. Stop the emphasis on 4-story buildings as the general solution to the City's school problems.

74. Spend more time analyzing the rapid changes in building materials, equipment and methods; for example, the use of moving stairways in multi-story schools.

75. Consider the feasibility of building schools that can accommodate a wave of student population through the various grades, changing in function as the demands change -- because of neighborhood and population changes -- from primary to secondary and then high school functions.

76. Investigate planning of buildings that may be readily changed to other occupancy after their use as schools is ended.

77. Utilize a research bureau for maintenance and remodeling as well as for new construction.
78. Design so that the result is economical, satisfactory, pedagogically correct and also pleasant to the least common denominator, the child, because children respond less to efficiency than to delight.
79. Supply freedom of action in site selection by more freedom in planning that will make it possible to use irregularly shaped plots.
80. Fit the basic structure - columns, floors and roofs - to a basic common module independent of mechanical services, interior partitions and even exterior walls, so as to make it a relatively easy and inexpensive process to make interior and even exterior changes in the building as use changes.
81. Consider the use for exterior walls of recently-developed manufactured panels; and of similar interior partitions in modular size which are easily demountable and reusable, and which would permit greater flexibility in use. Study the practicability of using demountable interior walls which would accommodate wiring and piping, so as to cut down on maintenance expenses.
82. Study the development of multi-use space, especially in widened corridors and circulation areas.
83. Recognize the real need for planning not only for today's needs but for an expanding school program that eventually will include younger children and older youth. If these future needs are not built into today's schools they may become obsolete within a decade or two.

CHAPTER XI. The Supply Operation -- A Management Challenge

84. Create a Board of Supply Standardization within the school system.

This Board, to be effective, must have a full comprehension of the nature of its problem and be prepared to act forcefully along the following lines:

(a) Drastic reduction in the number of non-list requisitions.

(b) Elimination of useless items from approved lists, abolition of duplications on the supply lists, and inclusion of items on the lists that are now repetitively requisitioned as non-list items, requiring thousands of separate and costly transactions.

(c) Rigid rules and regulations requiring schools to adhere to requisitioning systems.

(d) Better planning of supply needs to reduce greatly the wasteful, repetitious requisitioning of the same items during the school year.

85. Coordinate management of supplies by implementing the top reorganization plan recommended in the Interim Report of the Education Management Study.

86. Eliminate the present system of segregating supply accounts among ten divisions and consolidate these accounts into a centralized operation, thus saving many thousands of man-hours of work, and also giving fiscal responsibility to the local principals.

87. Provide more space for storage of supplies in the Long Island City depository, thereby eliminating wasteful shifting about of the same supplies because of lack of space.

88. Create a requisition revolving fund or similar device to enable schools to requisition on the basis of exact knowledge of moneys avail-

able, to replace the present guess requisitioning that results in a flow of thousands of requisitions through the Bureau during the school year, causing a never-ending backlog.

89. Create a purchase revolving fund to permit the Bureau of Supplies a legal, stabilized system of financing that would assure desirable flexibility in operation.

90. Transfer from the Bureau of Supplies functions not related to purchasing, such as auditing of carfare and domestic science bills.

91. Assign adequate personnel to the Bureau of Supplies to compensate the Bureau for additional functions assigned to it without any help to do the work, such as the purchase of mechanics' materials, furniture, and initial equipment in new school buildings.

92. Establish an in-service training course for all school employees concerned with requisitioning or other supply functions in order that they may have a better understanding of the supply operation and thus contribute to improving its efficiency.

93. Enact State legislation raising from \$1,000 to \$2,500 the level at which the Board of Education must purchase under formal contract procedures.

94. Grant authority to the Superintendent of School Supplies to enter into contracts for the Board of Education.

CHAPTER XII. The School Bus Transportation Program

95. Prepare a manual on the school bus transportation program which would clearly set forth program objectives and policies, the organizational responsibilities of those concerned with the program, and the

basic operating procedures for administration. A clear statement of what the program is, what it covers and what it does not cover, and who is responsible for specified phases, should help in reducing the number of complaints received concerning the program and also make unnecessary many time-consuming conferences now held to clarify operating responsibilities.

96. Improve the public relations aspects of the school bus program, which is the most liberal in the country, by a continuing program of education to acquaint parents and parent groups with the factors and reasons underlying the basic policy decisions relating to the service provided. Much confusion and irritation are caused by inadequate public understanding of the factors, especially the cost factors, which must be weighed carefully by members of the Board of Education and school officials in developing a sound program.

97. Improve the system of controls and reports maintained on the school bus program. Sound appraisal of the work of the Transportation Section of the Bureau of Supplies is hampered by inadequate administrative reports and records. For example, no daily or summary record is kept of complaints relating to service. This record should be installed immediately; it furnishes a key method of evaluating program performance. The Transportation Section should also render periodic reports on its work so that the Board's top supervisory officials would be in position to review and appraise the effectiveness of the program more easily than can be done at present. There should also be more detailed analyses of the reports on accidents submitted by the private bus company. These

reports are not presently checked for accuracy with the schools. In addition, the accident data are neither broken down by appropriate category nor summarized. These accident reports could provide the basis for the planning and execution of a sound accident - prevention program.

CHAPTER XIII. Payroll Mechanization

98. Centralize and mechanize the preparation of all school payrolls.

It is estimated that the clerical time that could be saved through payroll mechanization approximates 1,350 man-days a month or the equivalent of 71 full time school clerks, a clerical time value of more than \$200,000 a year. In the larger high schools, the recommended payroll procedure should permit the elimination of those clerical positions in which employees devote the major part of their time to payroll work. Probably 20 or more positions would be involved.

99. Simplify the payroll procedure by adopting the plan of equating all dates of entry and dates of return to duty after leaves, to the first calendar day of the month. Under the present procedure, a teacher's increment date can fall on any calendar day of the year. This practice unduly complicates payroll preparation and auditing.

100. Give local school principals the authority to approve payment for absences not exceeding ten days in the fiscal year, instead of only four days. This will reduce drastically the number of absence refunds and the special payroll computations required for such refunds.

101. Adopt the policy of prorating annual leave for newly - appointed teachers. About \$13,000 could have been saved on leave payments for new appointees in fiscal 1950-51 if this policy had been in effect.

CHAPTER XIV. Records Management

102. Develop a central program on records management in the school system. The present lack of clearly-defined policy on records maintenance, retirement, storage and disposal has created many problems. It has meant the loss or destruction of some permanent school records that are of great importance in the lives of former pupils. It has meant the accumulation of hundreds of tons of useless papers and documents. It has meant the loss of countless man-hours in locating valuable record information. It has meant the waste of money. It is estimated that approximately \$25,000 can be saved in filing cabinets alone at the headquarters building by the installation of an effective records management program.

103. Appoint a Records Management Committee which would have these functions: analysis of basic records maintained in the school system; the establishment of standards and controls for record making and record keeping; the adoption of procedures for the preservation of important permanent records; the study of records management methods, systems and equipment with a view to adopting those of value to the Board; and the development of retention schedules for the orderly, systematic retirement and destruction of records.

104. Establish a Records Management unit within the Office Services Division of the proposed Office of Business Affairs, to be headed by a records management officer trained and experienced in this work. This unit would be charged with responsibility for implementing the policies and decisions of the Records Management Committee.

105. Utilize more effectively the present storage space in the two basements and attic in the headquarters building. About 35,000 square feet of good storage space, worth at least \$35,000, can be used to establish a modern records center for the Board of Education.

CHAPTER XV. School Lunch Program

106. Eliminate the disparities that still exist in the operation of the school lunch program. Although the program in the elementary and junior high schools has been essentially unified, in the senior high schools, each cafeteria operates as a self-contained unit, doing its own buying and selling, its own hiring and firing of employees, its own gaining or losing of funds. The cafeterias that find it difficult to make ends meet, perhaps through inherent difficulties in operating conditions, are obliged to compromise on some lunch program objectives with resultant inequalities to the students.

107. Adopt a plan of disposing of high school cafeteria surplus funds which will enable the less favored cafeterias to purchase urgently needed equipment. The existing regulations for diverting a portion of unused surplus funds into a common fund to assist those schools which, for various reasons, do not accumulate a surplus, have not been followed. Under the plan recommended, the amount to be allocated to the common fund the first year would be about \$125,000.

108. Introduce a system of central purchasing of canned goods and other non-perishable groceries for the high school cafeterias. Savings could also be effected by central buying of kitchen supplies, detergents, paper goods, crockery, glass ware and utensils. Probably \$90,000 to \$100,000 annually could be saved on school cafeteria purchases through central buying of selected commodities. In addition to money savings,

central purchasing would permit better control of quality standards.

109. Require the Committee on High School Cafeteria Surpluses to meet more frequently so that requests for equipment buying can be processed expeditiously. Projects take longer to complete than necessary when the committee that must approve the request meets only two or three times a year.

110. Change the procedure on certification of invoices to require only the certification of the Director of School Lunches and the Auditor, not the additional certification of the Superintendent of School Supplies. This latter certification is meaningless since no physical inspection of the equipment purchased is made by the Bureau of Supplies.

111. Permit each high school cafeteria to purchase cafeteria equipment in an amount not to exceed \$500 annually for items that do not require installation, without going through the present prescribed procedure. Eliminating the smaller non-installation items, such as cash registers, dish trucks, rubbish carts, utility tables, scales and the like, from the stream of equipment buying should permit the several Bureaus involved to concentrate on the major items and thus serve to expedite their purchase and installation.

112. Expedite emergency repairs of cafeteria equipment by permitting each cafeteria to spend up to \$500 annually, using an outside contract service, to meet sanitation requirements or to rectify a hazardous condition, subject to approval of the expenditure by the Bureau of School Lunches. An alternative suggestion is to establish a separate plumbing, refrigeration and appliance section in the Bureau of School Lunches to

be paid out of cafeteria funds. A still better answer is to provide staff and competent supervision for the Bureau of Plant Operation and Maintenance so that it does the right kind of job in school cafeterias and elsewhere in the school system where maintenance is needed.

CHAPTER XVI. Educational Research and Statistics

113. Centralize all educational research in one Division of Research to be headed by an Associate Superintendent who would be responsible and accountable to the Deputy Superintendent of Schools. Currently, there are three separate Bureaus engaged in research: the Bureau of Educational Research, the Bureau of Curriculum Research, and the Bureau of Administrative and Budgetary Research. The existence of three separate research bureaus creates problems in organizational relationships and responsibilities.

114. Abolish the Bureau of Curriculum Research as a separate organization unit. This Bureau now is vested with responsibilities much broader than research, which constitutes only a relatively small part of its activities. The major work of the Bureau relates to the development and coordination of curriculum revision, the preparation of new curriculum programs, and their installation in the schools. The research function should be transferred to the Division of Research and the curriculum development phases to the proposed Division of Curriculum.

115. Reorganize the Bureau of Administrative and Budgetary Research by transferring to the proposed Office of Business Affairs, those activities essentially non-research in nature. The non-research functions presently carried by this Bureau relate chiefly to budget estimating and adminis-

trative management review. The major responsibilities in these areas should be vested in the Office of Business Affairs. The Bureau would continue to have chief responsibility for the collection and compilation of educational statistics, the preparation of statistical reports required for City, State and Federal authorities and for conducting the necessary studies for informed, objective action on budget requests for educational programs.

CHAPTER XVII. Statistical and Tabulating Operations

116. Improve the supervision and coordination of the Report Room and the Machine Room of the Bureau of Administrative and Budgetary Research. Better supervision and coordination could save annually \$7,710 in rentals of IBM equipment and \$2,500 in clerical time, a total of more than \$10,000 annually.

117. Coordinate the statistical and tabulating operations of the Bureau of Attendance with those of the Bureau of Administrative and Budgetary Research. The transfer of the current mechanical tabulating work in the Bureau of Attendance to the Division of Research would save \$7,500 a year on equipment rentals and manpower costs. An additional \$5,500 annually could be saved by having the Research Division prepare the monthly report on "Percentages of Attendance."

118. Consolidate and centralize the Machine Tabulating Units in the headquarters building as soon as practicable. Soon to be added to the separate IBM installations in the Bureau of Finance and the Bureau of Administrative and Budgetary Research are two additional IBM installations now on order for the Bureau of Plant Operation and Maintenance and the Board of

Examiners. For most effective utilization of this expensive equipment, a central tabulating unit with an experienced, competent supervisor, will be needed.

CHAPTER XVIII. Teachers Assigned to Headquarters

119. Revise the Bylaws of the Board of Education to set specific limits upon the maximum length of assignments of teachers to headquarters and to define the types of work to which school personnel may legally be assigned. A procedure should also be established for stricter review of initial assignments and renewals. The record of every teacher on assignment should be reviewed and a schedule published for the return to school duty of those at headquarters beyond the time limit. The original objectives of the Board in making these assignments are not being fulfilled. These were: first, to supply personnel for research or special projects, for a limited time, or, if long-term, by rotation of teachers to diffuse experience through the schools; second, to get around budgeting problems. In practice, the three-year limit on assignments has been disregarded and half the teachers assigned to headquarters have been there longer. The use of teachers at headquarters is false economy, for it nullifies administrative control over the departmental organization and personnel that the budget is supposed to exercise. The effect upon the morale of both teaching personnel and civil service employees is bad.

120. Maintain a complete and accurate record of each assignment to headquarters. This should be combined with a detailed analysis of the duties and responsibilities of each position. The jobs should be

evaluated; those having low pedagogical content should be consolidated wherever possible. The remaining work should be performed by civil service personnel recruited through regular channels. Both immediate and long-range savings can result. While it may be estimated that savings ultimately should amount to several hundred thousand dollars, an exact calculation of savings cannot be made until the Board undertakes the detailed job analyses recommended.

CHAPTER XIX. The Board of Examiners

121. Provide the Board of Examiners with appropriate offices. It presently has insufficient and inadequate space.

122. Assign to the Board an assistant examiner with legal training as well as teaching and supervisory background who would help the Corporation Counsel prepare the defense for the Board of Examiners when suits are brought against it.

123. Deny the Board's request for a public relations counsel. The greatest single improvement that needs to be made in the public relations of the Board is to open its meetings to the public.

124. Require the Board to prepare informative annual reports, minutes and activity budget estimates.

125. Give the Superintendent of Schools responsibility for supervising and directing the Board of Examiners.

126. Assign the Associate Superintendent in charge of Personnel as the Superintendent's representative on the Board of Examiners which should permit better coordination of the work of the Board with other parts of the school system.

127. Improve much-criticized appellate procedures by amending the Bylaws of the Board of Education to provide that the Superintendent of Schools shall establish a committee to hear complaints by applicants. The superintendent's committee should have power, among other powers, to evaluate the Board's model answers, which are now assumed to be infallible and which are kept secret, even at times between one examiner and another.
128. Replace retiring examiners with specialists in the fields of psychiatry, personnel psychology, psychometrics, or related disciplines, as well as with subject matter specialists, until some balance in the character and versatility of Board members has been achieved.
129. Increase the staff of the Investigation Division to permit it to do more intensive work.
130. Mechanize the Board's clerical operations.
131. Require the Board to make continual evaluation of its examination program and the effectiveness of its tests.
132. Develop the necessary research programs in the Board.
133. Relieve an examiner each year of his regular duties for assignment by the Superintendent of Schools to a position which would bring him in direct contact with pupils, probationary and experienced teachers, supervisors and administrators, so that the members of the Board of Examiners would have a more direct and intimate knowledge of what is actually taking place in the schools.
134. Reconsider the Board's policies in setting pass marks, which sometimes result in unnecessarily high failure rates for the higher licenses, particularly when the frequency of tests means that last year's failure is next year's success. Morale is adversely affected by such policies.

135. Test applicants for high supervisory licenses for their ability to unleash the creative talents of teachers, instead of mainly for subject matter mastery, which is an ability not necessarily related to the primary function of supervisors.

136. Modify the Board's recruitment and selection procedures so as to attract talented candidates from outside the city and to curtail the present excessive and unwholesome inbreeding.

137. Revise the policy of producing short lists by setting separate pass marks for small sections of tests, a policy which often favors applicants who are uniformly mediocre and eliminates many outstanding candidates.

CHAPTER XX. Personnel Administration

138. Terminate the present dual personnel organization structure that exists. The two separate personnel units should be brought together in the proposed Division of Personnel to be headed by an Associate Superintendent reporting to the Deputy Superintendent of Schools. The separation, based upon the distinction between pedagogical and administrative personnel, has led to inconsistencies in personnel practices and has impaired employee morale.

139. End the assignment of teachers to the Division of Personnel and Teacher Training. The three positions now filled by teachers assigned should be evaluated and duties, responsibilities and qualifications established. The positions should then be filled by recruitment through competitive examination.

140. Install an organized fact collection and compilation operation in the Division of Personnel so that personnel policies and compliance with

such policies can be evaluated. Analyses of rates and causes of absenteeism and turnover are especially needed.

141. Install a systematic method of editing, indexing, issuing and revising all material on personnel policies, practices and procedures. Periodic audits of compliance with policies and recommendations for changes could then be made.

142. Rotate the assignments of teachers in the various schools so that new teachers are not placed in the most difficult schools, and all schools may be assured of getting a fair distribution of teaching skills.

143. Eliminate the overlapping and duplicate ratings of teacher service, and develop a simple, realistic rating system in place of the present perfunctory one. In June 1950 only 19 teachers were rated unsatisfactory out of 35,479 teachers: this seems unrealistic.

144. Create a job analysis unit as a means of controlling payroll expense by classifying positions, and reclassifying them as changes occur, so that the Board does not pay any more or less than the jobs are worth.

145. Establish effective two-way communication between the Board's top management and its employees. The school system urgently needs an equitable system for the handling of employee grievances.

146. Review objectively the qualifications required of administrative positions at all levels. The emphasis on pedagogical background that now pervades the agency is detrimental to the morale of civil service employees, and prevents the full utilization of the skills and abilities of its administrative employees.

147. Expand the personnel activity for the Board's civil service group

of employees. The Personnel Office for these employees has not been given the authority and staff to execute a well-rounded personnel program.

148. Install a sound job classification and pay plan for the civil service employees. The lack of any system in the Board for objective job evaluation and classification has seriously handicapped the Personnel Office in the major personnel administration area: recruitment and placement, salary structure, promotion policy, merit rating and employee relations.

CHAPTER XXI. Office Services

149. Reassign certain space at 110 Livingston Street for better space utilization. Although space at headquarters is, on the whole, well utilized, at least 10,000 square feet can be salvaged for better use. For example, approximately 2,200 square feet can be salvaged from the 9,200 square feet now occupied by the Medical Division.

150. Install central forms control and standardization. Forms are now devised, designed and ordered by the individual bureau or division without central analysis or clearance. The academic and vocational high schools also operate largely on their own in designing and ordering forms. A saving of \$21,000 to \$30,000 could probably be effected on printing costs of forms by standardizing many of the forms now individually designed and ordered by the high schools.

151. Consolidate and centralize the duplicating services in the headquarters building. Throughout the building there are scattered 30 pieces of duplicating equipment in 13 separate bureau or divisional offices. Consolidation and centralization would mean better utilization of the

equipment by trained and experienced operators and a reduction in the amount of intra-building movement of paper, supplies and finished products.

152. Simplify the preparation of the Board's Building and Sites Committee calendar by (a) substituting a process control chart for Item 1 of the calendar which averages 115 pages and (b) multilithing on both sides of the sheet. The process control chart would not only reduce greatly the bulk of the calendar but would give the users fingertip control figures. Approximately \$3,000 a year can be saved in collating and mimeographing time and in paper costs by reducing the calendar from its present size of 165 pages to approximately 25 pages.

CHAPTER XXII. Office of Business Affairs

153. Group the three major business bureaus of the Board for better coordination and supervision. The Bureau of Finance, the Bureau of School Lunches and the Bureau of Supplies should be placed under the jurisdiction of the proposed Administrator of Business Affairs. Although these business bureaus are very ably administered each could do a better job if many policies and procedures within the school system over which they have little or no control were revised. Creating the post of Administrator of Business Affairs would mean that major responsibility for improving business management practices would be vested in one top executive who should be given the authority to carry out desirable changes in methods and systems.

154. Establish a Division of Management and Fiscal Control in the Office of Business Affairs. This Division should comprise three sections: Budgetary Analysis; Management Review; and Fiscal Control. The Budgetary

Analysis Section would have major responsibility for the administrative work involved in preparing budgetary estimates for the school system's many activities. The Management Review Section would be responsible for developing and executing management improvement programs throughout the Board of Education, including organization and methods studies, forms control, records management, equipment control, work simplification, and work measurement programs. The Fiscal Control Section would have responsibility for conducting periodic inspections, tests and audits to verify that services rendered, materials supplied and contract obligations are in compliance with specifications and requirements. It would also evaluate contract plans and specifications to ascertain that the interests of the school system are protected.

155. Coordinate the office services functions in the headquarters building and place these in an Office Services Division of the proposed Office of Business Affairs. The facilitative services needed in any large operation, such as mail and messenger, duplicating, timekeeping, records management, sale of publications, fees collection, are widely dispersed at present. Grouping these services into one division with responsible top supervision and leadership would improve their administration and management.

CHAPTER XXIII. Fiscal Relationships of the Board of Education With the Municipal Government

156. Decide whether the Board of Education should have responsibility for developing and executing the building program and whether it should have full authority to execute this responsibility, so that better work

can be done and so that the public will not be confused by buckpassing in holding the proper officials responsible for what has been done.

157. Stop the usurpation of power by the Budget Director's Office.

158. Correct the fundamental weakness in the Board of Education's budget making by installing an organized management approach. An organized management approach means continuous review and appraisal of all policies, operating systems and procedures. It means organization and methods analyses. It means work load studies and the fixing of work standards. It means critical review of the assumptions underlying budget estimates. And it means a staff of specialists to execute this program of review and appraisal.

159. Reexamine the basis on which the clerical allotment formula to determine school clerical needs was developed. Some schools may merit more assistance than the formula now provides, others less.

160. Substitute an objective method of determining the per capita need for educational supplies and equipment for the present guesswork.

161. Discontinue the arbitrary separation of funds into General and Special School Funds to improve budgetary methods and procedures. This separation is based upon a law passed 50 years ago, for reasons which no longer have significance.

CHAPTER XXIV. Fiscal and Political Responsibility

162. Grant the Board of Education fiscal independence from municipal authorities and fiscal responsibility. It should have full responsibility for, as well as control over the administration of its fiscal affairs. It should have a separate tax limit from the City's. Its budget should not

be subject to approval by municipal authorities. School district taxes should be levied by the Board and billed separately from those levied by the City.

163. Elect the members of the Board of Education, in order to obtain members who represent the whole community and not any particular group-- members who have demonstrated their competence and leadership and their unusual interest in public education.

164. Establish by law a nominating committee of 16 representative citizens designated by civic organizations and universities which would nominate for each vacancy on the Board of Education one person it considered well qualified to serve as a member. Permit other individuals to run against those nominated by this nominating committee upon filing a petition.

165. Increase the term of office to 12 years; elect three members every four years in the "off-year."

166. Choose Board members from the City at large rather than from specific Boroughs.

CHAPTER XXV. Local School Boards

167. Remedy the deterioration of the local school boards by changing their functions so that they would serve as lay advisory councils furnishing a two-way channel of expression between the schools and the public.

168. End political appointments to local school boards by substituting for appointment by Borough Presidents, appointment by the Board of Education of persons recommended by parents' organizations in the several school districts.

CHAPTER XXVI. The Road Ahead: A Decentralized School System

169. Begin planning for a decentralized system of education under which New York City would be divided into a fairly large number of communities each electing its own board of education, operating its own school system, and responsible to the State Department of Education for the maintenance of minimum standards; and each leagued with the others in a centralized, cooperative service organization for the entire City which would provide supply, maintenance and other facilitative services, and research. Methods must be developed for bringing the educational system closer to the people, not so that they may simply react to proposals as do civic organizations and parents' associations, but so that they can participate in the development of educational planning.

THE BOARD OF HIGHER EDUCATION

CHAPTER XXVII. The Administration of the Municipal Colleges

170. Reduce membership of the Board of Higher Education from 21 to 9, and appoint the members on the basis of city-wide rather than borough representation. The present Board is not of manageable size and cannot always make prompt, effectual decisions.

171. Give the State of New York proportional representation on a re-constituted Board of Higher Education, if state financial support to the municipal college system is substantially increased. The trustees representing the State should be nominated by the State University Trustees and formally appointed by the Governor.

172. Reorganize the committee structure so that the Board of Education would deal with more matters as a Committee of the Whole.

173. Provide for only three standing committees: Faculty and Educational Policy; Finance; and Plant Development.

174. Distinguish between the Board of Higher Education's policy-making function and the executive function, so that administrative detail will no longer require the Board's attention.

175. Establish the position of Chancellor. He should be the permanent chairman and chief executive officer of the Administrative Council. The central office directed by him would become the Administrative Council's fact finding, auditing and coordinating agency. The Chancellor should be nominated by the Administrative Council.

176. Change the title of the present administrator to "Assistant to the Chancellor in Charge of Board Affairs," with responsibility for acting as

administrative director of the central office.

177. Continue the Administrative Council in its present role.

178. Revise the faculty committee structure within the colleges.

179. Establish the position, within the colleges, of executive officer for academic personnel.

180. Reorganize the faculty councils, by reducing departmental representation and by abolishing representation by rank. Each department should elect one representative to the faculty council, the other members should represent the college-at-large.

CHAPTER XXVIII. The Need for Technical Institutes and Community Colleges

181. Establish additional junior colleges and technical institutes in the City of New York to meet the post-high school needs of the youth of the community, both for general and vocational training, which are not being met by the existing program of higher education. Publicly-supported two-year junior colleges and institutes should be recognized as an integral part of the public educational system.

182. Give careful consideration to the offerings of high schools in technical fields in planning community college development. A review of these offerings should permit a proper integration of secondary and post-secondary programs in areas of common interest with a minimum of duplication and a maximum of coordination.

183. Expand and diversify the publicly-supported facilities for the graduates of New York City high schools. Many able young people are now barred from applying for entrance to existing municipal colleges under present entrance requirements because they did not decide on college

attendance early enough to complete the prescribed subjects. Further, many graduates of academic, commercial and vocational high schools who would benefit from further full-time training refrain from applying to admission to the city colleges because they prefer a more direct induction to an occupation or are prevented from applying because of economic handicaps.

184. Adopt a plan for two-year community colleges to provide three kinds of educational programs: (a) a two-year (four-semester) program of general education which will enable qualified graduates to transfer to the other city colleges as juniors; (b) a two-year terminal program of general education; and (c) appropriate vocational programs of two years or less. These programs should be offered in two divisions of the proposed community college: a "School of General Education" and a "School of Terminal Education." The former would prepare students for the junior year of four-year colleges; the latter would provide a two-year program of terminal general education and terminal vocational programs of two years or less. All curriculums should lead to a diploma or certificate.

185. Establish a community college for the Borough of Richmond. At present this is the only Borough which does not have a publicly-supported institution of higher learning. In addition to serving the residents of Staten Island, this college might also serve a part of the population of Brooklyn.

CHAPTER XXIX. The Fiscal Relationships of the Board of Higher Education

186. Increase the financial support of the municipal colleges. No amount of managerial efficiency and economy will permit the accomplishment of desired higher educational objectives without additional funds. The lack of adequate financial resources has made it impossible for the Board of Higher Education to admit to the city colleges all those desiring and qualified for higher education. Inadequate support has led to these problems: a professional staff not large enough to properly care for the present enrollment; a salary structure too low to retain competent personnel; an understaffed, poorly paid clerical force; inability to make necessary building repairs to keep structures even at minimum standards; and the deferment of much need capital projects.

CHAPTER XXX. Fiscal Control by the Budget Director and the Comptroller

187. Free the Board of Higher Education from rigid control by city officials over the administration of its budget, a rigid control which limits efficient operation of the municipal college system and substitutes the city officials for the educational administrators in the determination of higher educational policies and programs.

188. Develop a functional program budget system for the municipal colleges.

189. Cut down on the present multiplicity of protective financial safeguards, and substitute a simpler system that would provide equally effective safeguards together with more significant cost data at less expense.

CHAPTER XXXI. For Incorporation in the State University

190. Transfer the municipal college system to the State University of New York, which should thereafter exercise full control over and take full responsibility for the management and support of the municipal college system as provided in Article 8 of the State Education Law. This would accelerate the process of equalizing higher educational opportunity, stimulate a healthier democracy by providing opportunity to study together to more young people of varied backgrounds, and result possibly in a potential benefit to the faculties through broader professional prestige and financial opportunities. A sounder and more equitable basis for financial support should develop from incorporation of the municipal colleges in the State University of New York.